



Pugwash Meeting on Jammu Kashmir

15-17 September 2013
Serena Hotel, Islamabad

FINAL REPORT

On 15-17 September 2013, Pugwash convened a meeting in Islamabad on issues related to Jammu and Kashmir¹ in cooperation with the Islamabad-based Center for Peace, Development and Reforms. Fifty-five participants from both sides of the LOC and from different political parties and groups discussed ways to improve in concrete terms the connections across the LOC, options for eliminating the restrictions that limit the movement and the freedom of the people in the entire region, and prospect to promote economic cooperation and development in the entire region. Pugwash convened similar meetings in 2004 in Katmandu and in 2006, in Islamabad. Pugwash held a similar conference in Islamabad involving participants from a wide political spectrum of both sides of the LOC. The current meeting took place at a time of tension. We regret that all invited participants were not able to travel for various reasons to the meeting. Some invited participants from India could not come since they either did not have a passport or did not have a political clearance from the government of India or could not have a Pakistan visa.

Moving forward

- Kashmiris must be part of the solutions, as this is not a bilateral issue, but a dispute of several entities. Increased Kashmiri leadership and public profile on these issues is urgently needed.
- Intra-Kashmir dialogue must be fostered to encourage further steps toward a more unified position. To do this the people must be allowed to meet, and the capitals must allow such interactions. The architecture of dialogue needs attention.
- Kashmiri civil society needs to be given space to further develop without interference of the military or other authorities.
- Further Track II discussions are essential. The group encouraged further meetings, and possibly the formation of a small tripartite committee or commission led by people on all sides, under the Pugwash umbrella, to continue to push these ideas, and emphasized the need for further such meetings wherever possible, including also in JK itself. It might be necessary to move to a third country if visa issues continue to hamper dialogue.
- The political leaders must also be involved and all sides should take steps to facilitate this type of dialogue. Earlier gains should be consolidated and further steps are needed.

¹ According to traditional Pugwash rules, participants took part in their individual capacities and while the substance can be reported out, no statement can be attributed to any single individual. This report reflects the general sense of the meeting, but no one statement should be linked to any specific participant.

CBMS

- Confidence-building measures (CBMs) themselves are not substitutes for a political solution or conflict resolution and prevention, but they can serve a positive role in improving the lives of people and in creating conditions that foster progress in other areas. These problems are multi-dimensional and the issues in Jammu and Kashmir on both sides of the Line of Control (LOC) demand creative approaches. As far as CBMs are concerned, low hanging fruits should be identified and focus should be on them. CBMs should change the reality of the lives of the Kashmiri people primarily in the sense of allowing the movements of people and goods in the entire region. However, CBMs must not engender complacency.
- Travel across the LOC should be made much easier. All five crossings points across the Line of Control crossing points should be functional. The opening of a road from Kargil to Skardu would be a very positive step. Visa issue should be significantly simplified and smart cards could be considered, making it easier for people to meet and move freely across the LOC. Increased cooperation with chambers of commerce to ensure visas for business people should be encouraged.
- Trade opportunities should be increased. At a time when India and Pakistan are improving trade, the list of items allowed across the Line of Control has shrunk. This list should be enhanced. Consideration could be given to making JK a free-trade zone for items produced and manufactured inside the zone, and consideration should be given to expanding to allow trade for items not of Kashmiri origin as well. Trade should be demand-based, not region-based. A system for intra-Kashmir trade should be established, including moving away from the barter system, establishing exchange rates, etc.
- Educational and other cultural cooperation should increase. This can include facilitating student exchanges, common research centers, external examiners, common admissions procedures, etc. International funding could be sought for joint intra university projects exploring pre-1947 history, common foundations of legal systems, linguistics, etc. Surveys, studies of the impact of the LOC might prove useful. Efforts such as meetings of vice chancellors should be facilitated. A lot can be done in the university context. Such initiatives should not be discouraged by the political structures and extend to tourism, environment, women issues, health, and other cultural issues.
- Exchanges of politicians should increase, possibly including consultative joint meetings of assemblies, meetings of prime ministers and chief ministers. Some think this is too difficult in current climate.
- Efforts to increase contact between bar associations should be facilitated (as already occurs in India/Pakistan).
- Telecommunications need to increase. Joint television and radio programming should be explored, increased telephone connectivity and infrastructures should be developed, etc., removing the embargo on people on various sides to communicate with the other. This includes allowing roaming facilities between the two countries and international mobile phone use for people visiting. Free access to the internet and social media should be allowed. The media has a special role, and efforts to encourage a JK media association, etc. should be supported.

De-militarization

- Demilitarization is integral to improving the lives of the people and decreasing conditions that fuel opposition. As one person said, “When pushing people to wall, the reaction is resistance.”
- Political will is needed to decrease the role of the military in the life of Kashmiris. This is essential to decrease the mindset of insecurity and fear that exists, to reduce environmental impacts, and also to create more crisis stability.
- The ceasefire is important and should be extended. A bipartisan mechanism to monitor the ceasefire should be considered. Cooperation on these issues should be strengthened at the at all levels of the state structures, and particularly at the joint secretary level.
- Various types of demilitarization can be considered: demilitarizing cities (‘withdrawal from the population centers to the barracks’); focusing on certain zones or areas, removing certain types of heavy weapons, etc. Reducing the visibility of the troops is essential. This is likely to be an incremental process, but it is essential to increase the quality of life for the people.
- Participants from the Indian side of the LOC pointed out that the Armed Forces Special Powers Act which gives immunity to armed forces and the paramilitary must be removed. In the near term its impact on the life of the people must be decreased. This will be helped by removal of the military from population centers.
- Judicial accountability should be increased. It might be useful to gather statistics or a ‘scorecard’ regarding the various policing mechanisms, to see outline how many taken under administrative detention procedures etc. are prosecuted.
- It was pointed out that in order to reduce militarization one needs: 1) a more cooperative approach between India and Pakistan on the management of the LOC; and 2) an active decision by the competent authorities of both sides of the LOC to reduce the pressure of the military on the civilian population.
- However, this is only part of the picture, as the absence of violence in the Kashmir Valley does not equal peace.

Intra-State Dialogue

- India and Pakistan must get back to dialogue and not delay for elections or other issues. There is a need for uninterrupted and uninterruptable dialogue on these issues. At a minimum, technical sessions related to the Composite Dialogue should keep going during this period. There is a need to move beyond stated positions and explore practical, achievable and implementable solutions, in conformity with the legitimate aspirations of Kashmiri people and which don’t jeopardize the security interest of India and Pakistan.
- The governments of India and Pakistan must make CBMs a meaningful, useful part of process of resolving larger issues. Taking steps now that are possible, even if only limited steps, will be recognized by the people in JK, even if they “roll their eyes.” Creative unilateral steps can be useful if reciprocal action is less possible.
- People of JK are the primary stakeholders in solving the problems between India and Pakistan, and can act as facilitators for improving relations between the two countries.

- Political leaders in Pakistan emphasize a broad consensus on the importance of normalizing relations with India, and see Kashmir as integral to that process. They express “cautious optimism” that things can move forward if there is also movement on the India side to improve atmosphere regarding the Composite Dialogue and related issues.
- There is a sense that while the people of India may desire a decrease in tensions, the domestic issues and political fragmentation in India combine with the multiplicity of crises in Pakistan to make the environment difficult for India to engage on issues related to Kashmir.
- Pugwash has focused elsewhere on the needs of increasing telecommunications and television and radio access in the two countries, reform of the visa regime (possibly toward a zero visa regime), direct flights, and other ways of bringing the people closer together. These sorts of issues continue to deserve close attention.
- Issues regarding natural resources and also disaster management, especially water (Indus waters, Siachen, etc), provide opportunities for creative solutions. Unresolved, they also provide potential continued and further conflict.
- Dialogue and perhaps a security agreement is needed regarding the possible impact of withdrawal of US and other troops from Afghanistan on the issues related to India/Pakistan relations and specifically on prospects for resolution of Kashmir related issues. Discussions on developing economic relations with Afghanistan should be a part of this discussion.
- Pugwash has previously facilitated intra-parliamentary exchanges, and has been encouraged to continue to foster such dialogue.
- Both Delhi and Islamabad should foster increased understanding of the complexity of the regional cultural landscape.
- The impact of Mumbai reverberates throughout both countries, but dialogue should not be held hostage to the whims of the perpetrators of such crimes. Lowering of the temperature between the two countries can help ensure that any possible future crisis is out of control.
- A truth and reconciliation process between the two countries might help.
- South Asia has not scratched the opportunities that exist for region cooperation and integration largely due to the mistrust that exists between these large countries in this region, and Kashmir is integral to reducing that mistrust.
- The presence of nuclear weapons in this region make it incumbent upon all sides to work with urgency seek to decrease tensions.
- The process of seeking a solution to the many issues may be long-term effort, but it is an essential and urgent undertaking.

 For further information:

Sandra Butcher, Senior Program Coordinator, sibutcher@earthlink.net, www.pugwash.org

APPENDIX A-Participant list

Pugwash Islamabad Meeting, Serena Islamabad Hotel, 15-17 September 2013

FINAL Participant List

INDIA

Suhasini Haidar is Foreign Affairs Editor at India's leading channel CNN-IBN. She is a prime-time news anchor and hosts the signature weekly world affairs show. "WorldView with Suhasini Haidar" (ibnlive.com/worldview). Her columns have appeared in several national dailies including the Hindustan Times, and the Hindu, and has also written for the News in Pakistan, and The Dhaka Tribune

Happymon Jacob, PhD, Assistant Professor, Centre for International Politics, Organization and Disarmament, School of International Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University

Ms. Jyoti Malhotra, freelance journalist, former Senior Editor at *Indian Express*

Hon. Syed Azeez Pasha, politician from Communist Party of India, former Member of the Parliament of India representing Andhra Pradesh in the Rajya Sabha.

J&K

Samir Ahmad, (Fulbright Scholar), PhD Research Student, Institute of Kashmir Studies (UNESCOMIKS), University of Kashmir

Prof. Noor A. Baba, Dept. of Political Science, former Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Kashmir, Srinagar, Kashmir

Dr. Shujaat Bukhari, senior journalist/writer based in Srinagar, currently Editor of Rising Kashmir, a leading English daily published from Srinagar and Jammu; also Editor of Buland Kashmir (Urdu) and Sangarmal (Kashmiri); general secretary of Adbee Markaz Kamraz, Kashmir's biggest and oldest federation of cultural and literary organization; member of South Asia Media Commission

Prof. Posh Charak, Professor of English and Chairperson, Department of English, University of Jammu; Director, Centre for New Literatures, Culture and Communication, University of Jammu

Zafar Iqbal Choudhary, Journalist & Policy Analyst, Asia Society Fellow on India-Pakistan Forum, Jammu, (Jammu & Kashmir) India

Tashi Gyalsen, Advocate practising in Leh, Buddhist, currently associated with Peoples Democratic Party as District President for Leh

Mr. Asif Lone, Chairman of the Cross LoC Trade (Salamabad-Chakoti Traders Union)

Mr. Mehmood ur Rashid, Opinion Editor and Columnist, Greater Kashmir

Fozia S. Qazi, Ph.D., Professor and Head, Department of Mathematics, Islamic University of Science and Technology, Awantipora, Kashmir

Mr. Zahoor Ahmad Shah, political activist of Peoples Conference was a close associate and confidant of its Chairman Shaheed Abdul Ghani Lone, keen observer of political developments in Jammu and Kashmir from very close quarters, Chairman of Trison Group of Companies

Prof. Gull Mohammad Wani, University of Kashmir, Srinagar

Siddiq Wahid, PhD, former vice chancellor Islamic University of Science and Technology, Awantipora, Kashmir

AJK

Barrister Sultan Mahmood Chaudry, former Prime Minister of AJK

Hon. Raja Farooq Haider, PML (N) AJK; former Prime Minister of AJK

Muhammad Matloob Inkalabi, Minister of Higher Education of AJK Government

Zulfiqar Abbasi, Center for Peace Development and Reforms (CPDR), Islamabad

Tahir Aziz, Conciliation Resources, London

Hon. Ibrahim Sardar Khalid, Kashmiri Politician and President of Azad Kashmir's Political Party Jammu Kashmir Peoples Party

Hon. Sardar Attique Khan, Muslim Conference; former Prime Minister of AJK

Ershad Mahmud, Center for Peace Development and Reforms (CPDR), Islamabad

Justice (retd) Abul Majeed Mallick, former Chief Justice, Azad Jammu Kashmir High Court

Chaudhary Manzoor, Businessman

Dr. Najeeb Naqi Khan, Member Assembly AJK , Vice President PML N AJK

Shah Ghulam Qadir, Chairman, Kashmir Institute of International Relations, Ex. Speaker, AJK Legislative Assembly, Secretary General, PMLn, AJK,

Dr. Sheikh Waleed Rasool, Director-Kashmir Institute of International Relations (KIIR), Islamabad; Columnist --The Daily Nawa-e-Waqt-Islamabad; Senior Research Fellow / Incharge, Peace and Conflict Studies, The University of A J&K

GILGIT-BALTISTAN

Mr. Ismail Khan, former journalist, public policy and development specialist, has worked on programs focusing on institutional capacity development, poverty reduction, and policy reforms; frequent op-ed contributor, Gilgit Baltistan

Hafeez U Rehman, Chief, PML(N) Gilgit

PAKISTAN

Amb. Shamshad Ahmad is a former Ambassador and Foreign Secretary of Pakistan who co-authored with his Indian counterpart in June 1997 the peace process familiarly known as 'Composite Dialogue' and also negotiated the final outcome of the historic India-Pakistan Lahore Summit in February 1999

Dr. Shaheen Akhtar She specializes in the area of non-traditional security, conflict resolution, conflict transformation and peacebuilding in the South Asian region (with particular emphasis on Kashmir) and foreign policy of major powers. She is recipient of several fellowships from the US, Sweden, China and Sri Lanka

H.E. Sartaj Aziz, Special Advisor (Acting Foreign Minister) to the Prime Minister for Foreign Policy and National Security

Hon. Ahsan Iqbal Chaudhary, Member of National Assembly, Federal Minister for Planning and Development, and Deputy Chairman Planning Commission of Pakistan; former Federal Education Minister of Pakistan; Deputy Secretary General and Member of the Central Executive Committee of the center-right party PML-N

Mr. Zahid Hafeez Chaudhri, Director, MFA, Islamabad

Gen.(ret) Asad Durrani; retired Lt Gen; former head of the ISI (August 1990-February 1992); after retirement from the Army, ambassador to Germany (1994-7) and to Saudi Arabia (2000-2)

Ejaz Haider, Editor, National Security Affairs, Capital TV; Visiting Fellow, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI)

Amb. Aziz Ahmad Khan, former Ambassador to Afghanistan and High Commissioner to India, Islamabad

Mrs. Aisha Khan, CEO of Mountain and Glacier Protection Organization MGPO

Amb. Maleeha Lodhi, Political Scientist, former High Commissioner of Pakistan to the United Kingdom and Pakistan Ambassador to the United States; former member of the United Nations Secretary-General's Advisory Board on Disarmament

Hon. Shafqat Mamood, PTI, Member of Parliament

Lt. General (ret) Talat Masood served in the Pakistani Army for 40 years, retiring in 1990 as Secretary for Defence Production in the Ministry of Defence. Prior to this, Lt. Gen. Masood was chairman and chief executive of the Pakistan Ordnance Factories Board, member of the Pugwash Council

Amb. Rustam Shah Mohmand, former Ambassador; former Consultant to UNHCR, Former Interior Secretary, Pakistan

Mr. Altaf Hamid Rao, Staff Reporter, Daily "The Nation", AJK Office, Mirpur (AJK), Pakistan

Amb. Sherry Rehman is the founding Chair and Executive President of the Jinnah Institute. She has served as Pakistan's Ambassador to the United State and was awarded the state's highest civil award, the Nishan-i-Imtiaz for her services to Pakistan

Hon. Abdul Sattar, former Foreign Minister of Pakistan

Hon. Ahmer Bilal Soofi, Advocate Supreme Court of Pakistan, former Minister of Justice

Mr. Imran Nadeem Shigri, Chief Executive Officer GB RSP since Nov 2013 and Chairmen Board of Directors GB RSP; Consultant for USAID Teachers Education Program from December 2012 to 30th June 2013; Chairman - Baltistan Culture and Development Foundation, 2006 to 2009,

Ms. Zarina Tabassum, Social Welfare Officer since 1990, 10 yrs as Lady Teacher in Education Department 1979-1989 (Baltistan),

PUGWASH AND OTHER

Mrs. Sandra Ionno Butcher, Senior Program Coordinator, International Secretariat, Pugwash Conferences, UK; Director, Pugwash History Project; Honorary Research Associate, Science and Technology Studies Department, University College London, sibutcher@earthlink.net

Prof. Paolo Cotta-Ramusino, Secretary-General, Pugwash Conferences on Science and World Affairs; Member, Pugwash Executive Committee; Professor of Mathematical Physics, University of Milan, Italy [formerly: Secretary General, Union of Italian Scientists for Disarmament (USPID); Director, Program on Disarmament and International Security, Landau Network – Centro Volta, Como, Italy], paolo.cotta@mi.infn.it

Dr. Andrew Wilder, Director of Afghanistan & Pakistan Programs, Center for Conflict Management, United States Institute of Peace (USIP), Washington DC, USA

Moed Yusuf, Senior Pakistan Expert, Center for Conflict Management, United States Institute for Peace, Washington, DC

Ms. Claudia Vaughn, Program Coordinator, Pugwash Conferences, Rome, Italy, pugwash@iol.it

APPENDIX B – Agenda/Schedule

Pugwash meeting on JK

Serena Hotel, Islamabad

15-17 September 2013

FINAL AGENDA/SCHEDULE

Sunday 15 September 2013

- 11:00 The meeting begins: presentation of main problems of inter-Kashmiri communications, and main points for improvement. Introduction by Secretary General of Pugwash
- 13:00 Lunch
- 14:30 Present status and goals for improvement of people-to-people communication and transit of goods. (Roads, trucks, buses. Transit documents. Phone communications, electronic communications, TV programs, etc.)
- 16:30 Break
- 17:00 Continuation
- 18:00 End of day's session

Monday 16 September 2013

- 9:30 Demilitarization of the region: its relevance for improving peace and tranquility in all of JK and the way forward.
- 11:30 Break
- 12:00 Continuation
- 13:00 Lunch
- 14:30 Possible Institutional cooperation: regional assemblies, judiciary, etc. Cooperation among cultural institutions.
- 15:45 Break
- 17:00 End of day's session

Tuesday 17 September 2013

- 9:00 Status of Kashmir in light of Indo-Pakistani relations . How making the LoC irrelevant can contribute to improving interstate relations
- 11:00 Break
- 11:30 Concrete suggestions for moving forward, proposals for solving outstanding Kashmir issues
- 13:00 Lunch
- 14:30 Summing up. Main points for an issue brief
- 17:00 Conference closes

* * *

Pugwash Conferences on Science and World Affairs *1995 Nobel Peace Prize*

Rome Office

Accademia dei Lincei
Via della Lungara 10
I-00165 Rome, Italy
Tel. (+39) 06 687-8376
Mobile: : (+39) 333-456 6661
Email: pugwash@iol.it

Geneva Office

16b la Voie-Creuse
1202 Geneva
Switzerland
Tel.: (+41-22) 908-5883
Mobile: (+41-79) 659-8186
E-mail: batsanov@hotmail.com

London Office

Ground Floor Flat
63A Great Russell Street
London WC1B 3BJ, England
Tel. (44) 7920-747560
E-mail: sibutcher@earthlink.net

Washington D.C. Office

1111 19th St., NW, Suite 1200
Washington, DC 20036 USA
Tel. (++1-202) 478-3440
Fax: (++1-202) 238-9604
E-mail: pugwashdc@aol.com

PUGWASH CONFERENCE ON JAMMU KASHMIR

(Islamabad, 15-17 September 2013)

For quite a few years now, both India and Pakistan have been speaking about “making the Line Of Control (LOC) irrelevant”. In reality, there has been to date very little progress and, in some ways, the LOC has become more difficult to cross now than in the past. In 2006, seven years ago, Pugwash organized a Conference in Islamabad where we invited participants from the entire political spectrum of both sides of the LOC. This conference was considered a positive step forward by both India and Pakistan. Pakistan’s leader at the time, Gen. Musharraf, held a discussion with the Conference participants, and a new emphasis was put on the need to facilitate communication across the LOC. After seven years, the situation on the ground does not appear to have much improved. In general terms, the crossing of armed militants across the LOC seems to have sensibly decreased, and so we have less military incidents across the LOC than, say, some years ago. But occasionally (see the recent events), there are still military incidents and the JK issue is still a thorny issue. In order to decrease further the tension, it is important that the people of JK (from both the parts administered by India and Pakistan) feel that the community that they belong to is, despite the division, still connected, and that exchanges of people, goods and ideas are possible.

Thus, we will hold a Conference in Islamabad on 15-17 September 2013 (arrival 14 September, departure 18 September), namely more than seven years after the Islamabad conference mentioned above. Participants from both sides of the LOC and from all different political parties and groups will be invited. The goal is to discuss and develop ideas and proposals that, if applied, would improve in concrete terms the connections across the LOC, would eliminate the restrictions that limit the movement and the freedom of the people in the entire region, and would promote economic cooperation and development in the entire region. While weapons and armed struggle are largely no longer considered as instruments for “solving” the problem of JK, still the “dividend of peace” is not yet available and the situation on the ground needs improvement. The limitations to the movement of people and to the circulation of goods and ideas are still severe, and people from the entire region resent the excessive militarization of the territory and the various types of discriminations to which they are subjected.

Among the general goals and concrete steps that could be considered, we can identify the following points.

1. Ease the exchange of people across the LOC. Reduce permit restrictions, and allow private vehicles to cross the LOC. Open more roads crossing the LOC and in general the border between India and Pakistan (including roads between Baltistan and Ladakh);
2. Improve unconstrained phone communications in the entire JK; make TV reception possible across the LOC and in general across the Indo-Pakistani boundary. Allow the establishment of cooperative TV and radio stations. Improve access to internet in all areas of JK (both Pakistani- and Indian-administered);
3. Improve in all possible ways cultural exchanges (including collaboration among Universities and research institutes) across the LOC;
4. Improve drastically the circulation of goods across the LOC, allow joint investments, render the currencies exchangeable, devise proper tax exemption schemes for joint business initiatives; take profit of the MFN status between India and Pakistan;
5. Promote cooperation and agreements on the issue of availability of water and the management of the natural resources;
6. Promote cooperation among political institutions, such as [consultative] joint meetings of state assemblies, consultations between stakeholders of AJK and of JK, etc.;
7. Push for a progressive de-demilitarization of the region on both sides of the LOC;
8. Promote cooperation among the judicial structures across the LOC. Develop cooperation among the military and the intelligence structures, while respecting the individual rights of all citizens, including the right to have a passport and to move freely in the entire region;
9. As the season of violence across the LOC appears to be less relevant than in the past, engage all former militants who would like to go back to political activity and establish, in an unequivocal manner, an environment where confrontation is addressed in political terms and not by violent means;
10. Solve in a dignified way the issue of Siachen, stressing the respect for human lives and the environment;
11. Deal with the issues of religious differences in the same spirit of tolerance and reciprocal respect that is taught by the Holy Quran, by the Vedas, the Tripitaka, the Guru Granth Sahib, and the Gospels.